क्षेत्रों की जरूरत ज्यादा है जहां पर चीन अपना व्यापार बढ़ाना चाहता है और हम मानते हैं कि शायद इसीलिए वह वहां पर सड़कें भी बनवाने का प्रयास कर रहा है ; जहां तक भारत के संबंध का सवाल है म्यां-मार से तो हम हर किस्म के व्यापार और दूसरे जो हमारे संबंध बढ़ सकते हैं उनको बढ़ाने के लिए तैयार है, लेकिन इन चीजों में दोनों तरफ से अगुवाई करनी पड़ती है । उनकी तरफ से जो भी अगुवाई होगी उसका हम जरूर सही तरह से जवाब देंगे और प्रयास करेंगे कि हम पूरे संबंध उनसे और मजबूत बनाएं । जहां बात रही औप-चारिकता की बात-चीत की, चर्चा की, उसमें जो चीज एजेंडा पर आती है उसका रेकार्ड जरूर बन जाया करता है । बहुत सारी बातें ऐसी होती हैं जिसको माननीय सदस्य जानते हैं, जो इनफार्मल तरीके से की जाती हैं, जिसका कभी असर होता है । अगर उनमें से कोई बात बढ़कर निकलती है तो उसका रिकार्ड भी कर लिया जाता

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 406

SHRI K. R. MALKANI: Will the Minister of Railways be pleased to state. ... *(.Interruptions).....*

I want to read it. The public should know what it is. We just give the number, and it does not make any sense to the public.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You speak after the Minister's reply.

**World Bank report on privatisation of Railways**

*406. SHRI K. R. MALKANI:!

*DR.* BAPU KALDATE:

Will the Minister of RAILWAYS be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government has seen the World Bank report On Indian Railways,

tThe Question was actually asked or. the floor of the House by Skri K. R. Malkaai.

briefly reported in the Indian Express of 15th April, 1995.

(b) if so, what is Government's reaction thereto and whether the proposed privatisation of Indian Railways would lead to a steep all-round rise in frsight and fares;

(c) whether Government had asked for World Bank advice and made Railway records available to them and if So, what are the reasons therefor; and

(d) whether Government would consider keeping World Bank and other such Western instruments of World control at arms length to maintain autonomy and independence in the functioning of Indian Railways?

THE MINISTER OF RAILWAYS (SHRI C. K. JAFFER SHARIEF): (.a) Yes, Sir.

(b) to (d) A statement is laid on the Table of the Sabha.

**Statement**

(b) to (d) The World Bank report does not propose privatisation of Indian Railways. The Bank has, however, suggested corporatisation of Indian Railways and also of its production units to begin with and to privatise the Production Units in the long run. Government had not asked for any advice from the World Bank. The published documents and material available on Indian Railways have been used and no additional records have been made available to them. These are only suggestions and Government has no such proposal under consideration at this stage.

SHRI K. R. MALKANI: (a) Is the Government not trying to make a distinction without difference? The World Bank has said, "privatisation". There is a newspaper report sayin,g that the World Bank is for privatisation. You say that they want corporation. Would you like to clarify the difference between privatisation and corporation? If it is intended to be a government corporation, then the Railways are already that. Why exactly are you making this distinction without a difference?

(b) This report makes many fantastic suggestions. One of these is that 400,000 people should be retrenched from the Rnilwavi. Anothr suggestion is that Fioductioj units of the Railways should be privatised. These include the Integ-ral Coach Faclory at Madras, Rail Coach Factory at Kapurthalla. Chitaranjan Locomotives, Wheel and Axle Plant at Bangalore and Diesel Component Works at Patiala. Is it a fact that Govenment is thinking of conceding some of these demands?

SHRI C. K. JAFFER SHARIEF: Mr. Chairman, Sir, this is an unsought advice. lt is not that we have sought any advice from the World Bank. Nor is this based on any study which we wanted them to undertake. This is based on the puhiications that the Railway Ministry publishes from time to time and which are being even placed on the Table of the House. They have taken some material from them and have made a study on their own and have made suggestions. So far as we are concerned, we have not asked them to study anything, nor have we asked for any report. The report which has appeared in the Press has been made by them 0n their own.

SHRI K. R. MALKANI: This report, which is obviously very authentic, says that the Government is considering handing over some tourist trains to private agencies. This report also says that the Railways are looking for private parties to enter into capital intensive projects like the "Build, Own, Lease, and Transfer" or "BOLT" Scheme. What has the hon. Minister to say on these t./o scores?

SHRI C. K. JAFFER SHARIEF: Yes, Sir. So far as the tourist trains are concerned, ft is not something new. We are already having it in Rajasthan. The Railways is running the tourist train and the Rajasthan Tourist Corporation is operating it. Similar to that, when various demands have come from other parts of the country, we have come out with a proposal of eight circuits in different parts of the country and w« hate said that the private sector can come in. We will be giving the track and signalling service. The rest cf it they will have to bring in and operate. This is a particular area of toiu-ism where we have said that the private sector can come in because the Railways cannot And resources for that.

डा० बापू कालदाते : सर, मुझे यह सुनकर आश्चर्य हुआ कि अब विश्व बैंक के लोग हमारे देश के सभी क्षेत्रों में हम लोगों को सलाह देने लगे हैं। आपने तो कहा है "बिना मांगे" लेकिन जब वे लोग बिना मांगे कुछ सलाह देते हैं तो यह समझना आवश्यक है कि वह बिना मांगे, बिना जरूरत सलाह नहीं देते हैं। इसका मतलब यह है कि उनके मन में कुछ बातें अवश्य हैं कि हरेक क्षेत्र में आपके ऊपर, मैं दुर्व्यवहार नहीं कहता, कोई-न-कोई दबाव डाला जाए। तो हमें समझ नहीं आ रहा है कि जो आपने मांगा नहीं, वह बड़ी उदारता से आपको क्यों दे दिया ? दूसरे यह कि आपने अंत में जो बात कही है, उसके बारे में म आपसे स्पष्ट जवाब चाहता हूं। आपने इतना ही कहा है कि :—

"These are only suggestions and Govarnment has no such proposal under consideration at this stage."

आपने कहा, जो नहीं है, तो क्या हम यह समझें कि जो आज नहीं है, वह शायद उनके सुझाव के बाद, विश्व बैंक ने आपको जो कुछ एडवाइस दी है, कुछ दिनों के बाद आप इसको अपनाएंगे, ऐसा हम समझकर चलें या आप कभी भी नहीं अपनाएंगे, ऐसा समझकर चलें ?

श्री सी०के० जाफर शरीफ : चेयरमैन सर, जो भी सुझाव उन्होंने अपने आप दिया है, अगरचे इसमें कोई सुझाव लगता है कि यह देश के और देश की जनता के हित में है तो इसके लिए कोई सीमित वक्त का निर्धारण करने की जरूरत नहीं है।

अगरचे कोई सुझाव अच्छा है तो हम उसको अपना लेंगे। मगर सवाल यह है कि हमने उनसे कोई सुझाव नहीं पूछा और न उन्होंने जो सुझाव दिया है, वह हमें आज जरूरी

लगता है, इसलिए जो सवाल आप पूछ रहे हैं, वह आज के हालात में पैदा नहीं होता।

**डा० बापू कालदाते** : यह सुझाव आपको पसंद नहीं है या इस समय वह आवश्यक नहीं है ?

**श्री सी०के० जाफर शरीफ** : बंधन तो नहीं है, जब आवश्यकता पड़ेगी देखेंगे।

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to lake the argument of my senior colleague, Dr. Bapu Kaldate a little higher. I would like to know from the Minister whether the World Bank is competent to undertake a .study on its own initiative and tender unsolicited adtvice. T would like to know whether it is permissible. T suppose we still have a sovereign Government. That is one part.

Secondly, we have .seen from the previous experience that to3ay's World Bank's agenda become the agenda of our Government tomorrow. So, this is the World Bank's agenda today. This is not the Government's agenda today. How are we sure that this will not become your agenda tomorrow?

Thirdly, 'sir, since this advice is of an academic kind, will this report be made public? Why is it being treated as classified?

SHRI C, K, JAFFEr SHARIEF; Mr-Chairman, Sir, my lion, friend, I think, is quite aware that the question has arisen out of the report which has already been published In the newspaper.

SFTRT S. TATPAt REDDY: Tt was n news item. If the Minister does not understand the' difference between a scooo ard feaular publication of a report I cancot take the time of the House tt educate him.

SHRI C. K. JAFFER SHARIEF: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I knew my hon. friend from his young age and he has been very smart and eloquent. He need not impress upon me, again and again. He said about the World Bank. I do not think that we sfiould be very toucliy about 'it. So far as any financial institution is concerned, they are naturally interested in conducting various kinds of study, and wheflier we want it or we do not want it is a different issue.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Without the cooperation of the Government Department, World Bank cannot undertake such a study. Did the Government cooperate?

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: They are giving that cooperation.

SHRI C. K. JAFFER SHARIEF: As I said earlier, neither we have made any request to them nor we have supplied any document. This is based on the documents which are available to them from' various sources and which are even available to you. They have made some study, lf some suggestions are good, then, we will get ourselves educated from them and make use of them. There is no bar. T feel we should not be touchy about it.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. Chairman, Sir, T crave your indulgence. T seek your protection. Do you think all questions of mine were answered? After all, Sir, the Minister is accountable to the House.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can you rephrase your question concisely? .. . *{Inter-ruptions)* . .*Can* you rephrase your question concisely which he has not answered?

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Mr. Chairman, Sir. the Minister should stop) beating about the bush and should come to the Pnint.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: We wanted 'him to say categorically whether the Government had told the World Bank that it was none of their business to give unsolicited advice to the Government of India. I would like to know whether they have done it. That is the only question which is tormenting the entire House. Our sovereignty has been bartered away.

MR CHAIRMAN: You have not asked him whether the Government aavees with the suggestions or not.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Let him say that he has told the World Bank that it is none of their business to give unsolicited advice to the Government of India. Let him say He should have been categorical.. *(Intemiptions)...* He should have been categorical .

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please do sit down.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Sir. another important part of my unanswered question is..

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Mr. Reddy. let him say that the Government has told, them that it is none of their Business to malce this unsolicited advice.

MR. CHAIRMAN; T have only asked Mr. Reddy to put that question .

SHRI S, .TAIPAL REDDY; Sir, in addition to the clarification which Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta is seeking which was part of my question, another part is whether the Government will publicise the report as a whole without treating it as a classified document.

SHRI C. K. .TAPPER SHARIEP: Mr. Chairman Sir, I will go into the questions,

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Mr. Chairman sir, may I have your per-mission ?sir, may I have your per-mission > sir may I have your per-

Sir, I seek your protection. Sir, 1 seek your protection. Mr. Reddy has endorsed my question. The question is very simple. Has the Railway Minister told the World Bank that it is none of their business?

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am sorry. Question Hour is over. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI GURUDAS DAs GUPTA: We want a half-an-hour discussion.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: There are occassions when the Chairman can make an exemption. *(Interruptions),* The Minister has got away . ..*{Interruptions)* .

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question Hour is over. Papers to be Laid on the Table. Shri Jaffer Sharief.

## WRITTEN ANSWERS TQ QUESIIONS

### Villages without Post Officer in Gujarat

*402. SHRI ANANTRAY EVSHANKER DAVE: Will the Minister of COMMUNICATIONS be pleased 10 state:

(a) whether Government have con' ducted any survey in Gujarat regarding the villages which do not have Post Offices at present;

(b) ir so, what are the district-wise details thereof;

(c) by when Government propose to open Post Offices in all the villages of the State: and

*(d)* whether Government propose to make available mobile Post Offices in such villages of the State for the time being, to cater to the postal needs of villagers"

THF MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATIONS (SHRI SUKH RAM): (a) and(b) Yes . sir However the district wise details